**Deryl & Paige**

* Will the lengths of your observations be sufficient to create a light curve for these planets, which have ~.5 day periods? Will the light curves show complete transits?
* Over the course of your observing plan, your targets at times dip below 20 deg altitude. This increased airmass will make it difficult to see your relatively faint star
* SCORE: 4.5/5

**Na’ol & Nabeel**

* How do you know how much the H-alpha lines will be redshifted? Can you be sure that the H-alpha + 13 filter will be able to detect the necessary line?
* Once you have detected the H-alpha line, how will you measure the luminosity?
* SCORE: 4/5

**Andrew G. & Dante**

* How do you know which regions are star forming and which are not?
* How do you know if a supernova is a CCSN?
* How will you combine spectral data with spatial data?
* How will you be able to observe a transient event in such a short time scale? Are there some going on now? Will you wait and see?
* SCORE: 3/5

**Carter & Andrew L.**

* Why are KIIvw stars important?
* What allows you to assume that M92 is older than M13? Seems like ages are similar.
* How does the age of NGC 6539 compare to the ages of M92 or M13? This is an extra variable you may not be accounting for
* In your motivation, you say that metallicity increases over time. This seems like the conclusion you were trying to make. Therefore, what’s the point?
* KIIvw stars stars evolve at different rates than other stars. How can you make conclusions about the metallicity of a cluster based on only one type of star if other types of stars may have different metallicities?
* You have to assume NGC 6539 is dominated by KIIvw stars. Is this appropriate? You may be better off observing individual KIIvw stars in the cluster, as you did with the others.
* I’m confused about what you mean with the highlighted targets
* SCORE: 3/5